

### governmentattic.org

"Rummaging in the government's attic"

Description of document:	National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA) records regarding issues with parachute riser/link/attachment on the Starliner spacecraft 2022-2024
Requested date:	12-May-2024
Release date:	06-September-2024
Posted date:	06-October-2024
Source of document:	FOIA Request Government Information Specialist c/o NASA Headquarters MS 5-R30, 300 E Street, SW Washington, DC 20546 Email: hg-foja@mail.nasa.gov

The governmentattic.org web site ("the site") is a First Amendment free speech web site and is noncommercial and free to the public. The site and materials made available on the site, such as this file, are for reference only. The governmentattic.org web site and its principals have made every effort to make this information as complete and as accurate as possible, however, there may be mistakes and omissions, both typographical and in content. The governmentattic.org web site and its principals shall have neither liability nor responsibility to any person or entity with respect to any loss or damage caused, or alleged to have been caused, directly or indirectly, by the information provided on the governmentattic.org web site or in this file. The public records published on the site were obtained from government agencies using proper legal channels. Each document is identified as to the source. Any concerns about the contents of the site should be directed to the agency originating the document in question. GovernmentAttic.org is not responsible for the contents of documents published on the website.

-- Web site design Copyright 2007 governmentattic.org --

National Aeronautics and Space Administration



Headquarters Washington, DC 20546-0001

September 6, 2024

Reply to attn. of: Office of Communications History and Information Services Division

### Re: NASA FOIA Tracking Number 24-00820-F-HQ

This is our final response to your Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) request to the National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA), dated May 12, 2024, and received in this office on May 13, 2024. Your request was assigned the above-referenced tracking number. You seek:

A copy of each NASA report, memo and presentation slide deck regarding issues with the parachute riser/link/attachment on the Starliner spacecraft, and/or resolution of those issues. Please limit this request to records during the years 2022 to the present.

-Exclude exclusively proprietary records.-Limit search to higher level NASA overviews that discuss the challenges or concerns that have been publicly reported. -Limit search to records that subject matter experts are aware of – exclude bulk and lengthy computer searches.

-Include only Boeing information; exclude other company's/companies' information. (Date Range for Record Search: From 1/1/2022 To 5/13/2024)

In an email, dated June 10, 2024, you agreed to narrow your request to exclude information pertaining to other companies, and only include information pertaining to Boeing. A copy of that email is enclosed for reference.

In response to your request, we conducted a search of NASA's Kennedy Space Center, Commercial Crew Program Office using the information provided in your request. That search identified records responsive to your request. We reviewed the responsive records under the FOIA to determine whether they may be disclosed to you. Based on that review, this office is providing the following:

- 32 page(s) are released in full (RIF); $^{1}$
- 27 page(s) are released in part (RIP);

NASA redacted from the enclosed documents certain information pursuant to the following FOIA exemptions:

#### Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3)

Exemption 3 concerns matters that are "specifically exempted from disclosure by statute if that statute (i) requires that the matters be withheld from the public in such a manner as to leave no discretion on the issue; or (ii) establishes particular criteria for withholding or refers to particular types of matters to be withheld." 5 U.S.C. § 552 (b)(3).

• Pursuant to the Arms Export Control Act, 22 U.S.C. § 2778(e), NASA withholds certain information pertaining to export license applications and items that are on the U.S. Munitions List (22 C.F.R. § 121.16).

#### Exemption 4, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4)

Exemption 4 protects trade secrets and commercial or financial information obtained from a person that is privileged or confidential. See 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4). The Supreme Court of the United States has held that where commercial or financial information is both customarily and actually treated as private by its owner and provided to the government under an assurance of privacy, the information is "confidential" within the meaning of 5 U. S. C. §552(b)(4). *Food Marketing Institute v. Argus Leader Media*, 139 S. Ct. 2356 (2019). Thus, NASA invokes exemption 4 to protect internal Boeing processes and methodologies, Boeing product manufacturing and design information, and contract cost performance information.

#### Exemption 6, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(6)

Exemption 6 allows withholding of "personnel and medical files and *similar files* the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(6)(emphasis added). NASA invokes exemption 6 to protect third party private company employee names.

#### Fees

Provisions of the FOIA allow us to recover part of the cost of complying with your request. In this instance, because the cost is below the \$50 minimum, there is no charge.

#### Appeal

You have the right to appeal my action regarding your request. Your appeal must be received within 90 days of the date of this response. Please send your appeal to:

<sup>1</sup> All page counts are approximate numbers.

Administrator NASA Headquarters Executive Secretariat ATTN: FOIA Appeals MS 9R17 300 E Street S.W. Washington, DC 20546

Both the envelope and letter of appeal should be clearly marked, "Appeal under the Freedom of Information Act." You must also include a copy of your initial request, the adverse determination, and any other correspondence with the FOIA office. In order to expedite the appellate process and ensure full consideration of your appeal, your appeal should contain a brief statement of the reasons you believe this initial determination should be reversed. Additional information on submitting an appeal is set forth in the NASA FOIA regulations at 14 C.F.R. § 1206.700.

#### **Assistance and Dispute Resolution Services**

If you have any questions, please feel free to contact me at derek.m.moore@nasa.gov or (202) 358-2681. For further assistance and to discuss any aspect of your request you may also contact:

Stephanie Fox FOIA Public Liaison Freedom of Information Act Office NASA Headquarters 300 E Street, S.W., 5P32 Washington D.C. 20546 Phone: 202-358-1553 Email: Stephanie.K.Fox@nasa.gov

Additionally, you may contact the Office of Government Information Services (OGIS) at the National Archives and Records Administration to inquire about the FOIA mediation services it offers. The contact information for OGIS is as follows: Office of Government Information Services, National Archives and Records Administration, 8601 Adelphi Road-OGIS, College Park, Maryland 20740-6001, e-mail at ogis@nara.gov; telephone at 202-741-5770; toll free at 1-877-684-6448; or facsimile at 202-741-5769.

*Important*: Please note that contacting any agency official including myself, NASA's FOIA Public Liaison, and/or OGIS is not an alternative to filing an administrative appeal and does not stop the 90 day appeal clock.

Sincerely,

Derek Moore Government Information Specialist

Enclosure(s)

# Commercial Crew Program Status to ASAP

### Steve Stich Program Manager, Commercial Crew Program August 2, 2023

#### ITAR Category XV, (f), ECCN 9E515.a, EAR99 NLR

- International Traffic in Arms Regulations (ITAR) Notice -

This document contains information which falls under the purview of the U.S. Munitions List (USML) as defined in the International Traffic in Arms Regulations (ITAR), 22 CFR 120-130, and is export controlled. It shall not be transferred to foreign nationals in the U.S. or abroad without specific approval of a knowledgeable NASA export control official, and/or unless an export license or license exemption is obtained/available from the United States Department of State. Violations of these regulations are punishable by fine, imprisonment, or both. Reference EDR Log #: 13500 NASA KSC Export Control Office, (321) 867-9209

#### CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74C / Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government may disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure. (b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government to in ald ata first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract.

(b) in the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract. (c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel, and Aerospace Safety Advisory Panel

unless marked otherwise.





# **CST-100 Drogue and Main Low Margin – Soft Links**



#### **Public Status:**

Available for Public Discussion

- New soft link joint identified that will meet the required 2.0 factor of safety for the main and drogue parachutes.
- The new joint design is in testing.
- Recent Technical Interchange Meeting at the parachute supplier verified no other joint concerns on the parachute system.
- Background:
  - (b) (4)
    - Testing was from 2009, configuration was incorrect for CST-100 application
    - Airborne found error upon final "scrub" of report for VCN submittal
    - (b) (4)
- Status:
  - \_ (b) (4)
    - (b) (4)
  - Boeing has elected to move to the 511 main parachute chute configuration for CFT
    - This change will incorporate the new soft link design, a pre-planned upgrade to reinforce the suspension line strength in some key areas and will require a drop test for validation.
- Path Forward:
  - \_ (b) (4)
  - Resultant Main FOS = 2.25 (against 2.0 requirement); Drogue FOS is higher
  - Final flight drawings for soft links in work and will be implemented on CFT+ Internal ASAP Use Only





# Forward Heatshield Parachute (FHSP) Over-Q Test



### Public Status:

Available for Public Discussion

- Recently executed the planned Forward Heat Shield parachute ground test.
- The system performed nominally.

#### Test Configuration and Results:

 Testing was conducted at the Navy's China Lake Naval Air Warfare Center on 6/8/2023







Internal ASAP Use Only



# **D-Ring Retention System IFA Closure**



### Background:

- OFT-2 retention system IFA root cause determined to be out-of-sequence loading during deployment (pilot load arrived before rings released)
- During CFT Main parachute removal, D-rings were found slightly bent (for a system that had not yet been deployed)

### • Status:

- Fault tree re-opened, investigation ongoing
- Likely root cause is damage to D-rings during final packing load application
  - Lid application requires roughly 100,000 lbs force
  - D-rings are in the load path, oriented in a manner that would cause bending
  - Witness marks on packing fixture lid show extremely high loads

### • Forward Work:

- Design modifications to add cutout to the lid in work to remove the D-rings from the load path
- Note that it is NOT clear whether packing is the only factor in bending or is a contributory factor
  - It is a fact that loading is out-of-sequence during deployment
  - Bending may be caused by packing, deployment, or both
  - Packing trials ongoing to verify changes

Internal ASAP Use Only









Orientation of D-Ring during packing



# **Parachute TIM / System Review**

- Combined NASA / Boeing / Airborne teams held a TIM at Airborne 7/10/23 7/13/23
  - Goal was to make decisions on open issues and resolve the path forward for soft links and retention system
  - In addition, the team worked to ensure there were no additional issues not yet identified, and worked to minimize the opportunity for issues moving forward
- Seam and Joint Deep Dive
  - Independent NESC / Parachute expert came in and reviewed the seam and joint report / data and individual seam and joint sample drawings
  - There were several minor findings, one joint will need to be retested (not a driving joint does not affect margins)
  - Boeing identified several joints that need additional testing to get from 5 to 10 samples, per requirements

### Design Review

- The integrated team walked through the CST-100 design in depth to assess all design and analysis assumptions no significant findings
- CST-100 parachutes were designed over a decade ago, and last built in 2016
  - Airborne within the last month completed a thorough internal review of all drawings for completeness / clarity and made updates prior to the start of PCM-1 parachute fabrication

### • Surveillance

- Boeing has recently implemented Mandatory Inspection Points (BMIPs) during manufacturing, packing, integration where Boeing witness and signoff is required during Airborne processing
- NASA has inserted PAAs (Product Assurance Actions) to witness packing and integration as well as perform "clear to pack" reviews and perform record reviews for all parachutes

# Commercial Crew Program Status to ASAP

### Steve Stich Program Manager, Commercial Crew Program February 8, 2023

ITAR Category XV, (f), ECCN 9E515.a, EAR99 NLR

- International Traffic in Arms Regulations (ITAR) Notice -

This document contains information which falls under the purview of the U.S. Munitions List (USML) as defined in the International Traffic in Arms Regulations (ITAR), 22 CFR 120-130, and is export controlled. It shall not be transferred to foreign nationals in the U.S. or abroad without specific approval of a knowledgeable NASA export control official, and/or unless an export license or license exemption is obtained/available from the United States Department of State. Violations of these regulations are punishable by fine, imprisonment, or both. Reference EDR Log #: 13500 NASA KSC Export Control Office, (321) 867-9209 CCCCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74C / Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government makes such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure.

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract. (c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel, and Aerospace Safety Advisory Panel.





# **OFT-2 In-Flight Anomaly (IFA) Summary**

- Total of 14 IFA's were identified from OFT-2 by NASA
   8 are closed
- Projected schedule for remaining items listed below

Systems Office Issue Title	Status	PCB Agenda ID (Required For Closure)
SC	Open	PCB February 2023
SC	Open	PCB February 2023
G&MO	Open	PCB February 2023
LV	Open	PCB February 2023
sc	Open	PCB February 2023
SC	Open	PCB February 2023
sc	Closed (CFT only)	JPRBC November 15
SC	Closed	PCB January 10
SC	Closed (CFT only)	PCB January 10
SC	Closed	PCB November 8
SC	Closed	PCB January 10
SC	Closed	PCB December 8
SC	Closed	PCB November 29
sc	Closed	PCB September 23

As of 01/26/23



# **CFT / PCM Parachute Design and Cert**

### Background

- CFT and PCM-1+ parachute system designs have been baselined
- Status
  - High dynamic pressure/Over-Q airdrop testing for the drogue and main parachutes completed at the Yuma Proving Ground 11/15/2022
  - Successfully demonstrated a drogue mortar packing change. Pneumatic mortar testing to complete validation of this change is currently on hold after completion of 1 of 4 test shots at parachute vendor (ECD: February 2023)
  - High dynamic pressure testing for the Forward Heatshield Parachute (FHSP) is currently in planning

### • Path forward/flight rationale

- VCN Closure
  - Boeing has submitted 23 of 33 Verification Closure Memos (VCMs) for NASA review. Substantial work to resolve questions and obtain remaining artifacts.
  - Remaining VCMs planned for delivery during the week of 2/6
- Hazard Reports
  - Boeing and NASA Parachute Teams made significant progress at two recent TIMs
  - Parachute HR is scheduled for STRB review and Phase III kickoff
- CFT Parachutes
  - Two open S&MA Finding Letters regarding packing cycles and a slipped packing plate are planned for closure at PAA Forum based on use of appropriate degradation factor
- PCM-1+ Parachute design change has been concurred
  - Implementing a change to the joint design at each radial to suspension line attachment
  - Design change increases joint efficiency and improves margins in the main parachutes. Final margins are under review.
  - Supply chain delays and long lead procurement are schedule risks for PCM-1

Single flight use of Starliner main parachutes for CFT and procuring new build main parachutes for PCM-1+

CUI//SP\_EYPT/SP\_PPOPINI//DL\_ONLY

# Commercial Crew Program Status to ASAP

### Steve Stich Program Manager, Commercial Crew Program March 19, 2024

#### ITAR Category IV (i)

- International Traffic in Arms Regulations (ITAR) Notice -

This document contains information which falls under the purview of the U.S. Munitions List (USML) as defined in the International Traffic in Arms Regulations (ITAR), 22 CFR 120-130, and is export controlled. It shall not be transferred to foreign nationals in the U.S. or abroad without specific approval of a knowledgeable NASA export control official, and/or unless an export license or license exemption is obtained/available from the United States Department of State. Violations of these regulations are punishable by fine, imprisonment, or both. Reference EDR Log #: 14840 NASA KSC Export Control Office, (321) 867-9209

#### CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74C / Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government makes such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure. (b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government the after propose right in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract.

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract. (c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

> Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel, and Aerospace Safety Advisory Panel unless marked otherwise.



# **Starliner Parachute Status**

Current Status:

Available for Public Discussion

- The modified parachute system, with redesigned soft link joints and a strengthened suspension line textile joint, was tested over the Arizona desert on Jan. 9
- Parachute deployment and a soft landing of the test article were confirmed.
- Data analysis of the two-parachute test confirm primary test objectives were met.
- Engineering teams have reviewed the results, inspected the test parachutes, and are working to complete system certification.
- Issue: Soft Link seam and joint testing (4k Kevlar 3-Turn) resulted in reduced capability from previous test; Factor of safety (FoS) was found to be below requirement of 2.0

#### Background/Status

- The soft link was redesigned to increase strength / margin
  - New design exceeds FoS requirement of 2.0
- Boeing incorporated the new soft link design as well as an upgraded radial at suspension line joint design into new
  parachute release chose to fly the new design (-511) on the CFT mission
  - All -511 main parachute changes (soft link, radial at suspension line joint, retention system) successfully validated via NPCQT-02 drop test conducted 1/9/2024
- Boeing final analysis shows positive margins for main parachutes, NASA IV&V margins in work

#### Path Forward

- Final seam and joint testing with lot specific materials Complete
- Parachute System Margin Calculations ≥1.6FoS Complete
  - NASA IV&V margins in work ECD 3/27/2024
- Flight Parachutes Deliveries and Installation: Complete
- Drop Test NPCQT-02 (NASA performed): Complete
- Drop Test Data Review: Complete
- Parachute VCNs Approved: Planned closure JPCB 3/27/23
- Hazard Report Status: Planned closure STRB 3/22/2024

(b) (4)

Internal ASAP Use Only

Suspension Line analysis



## **Parachute Retention System IFA**

- **Issue Statement:** During removal of main parachute retention systems on CFT, all horizontal retention strap D-Rings installed on new main deployment bags were observed to be bent.
- Background/Status:
  - CCTS had dispositioned bent D-Rings phenomenon observed after drop tests and OFT / OFT2 test flights with belief that bending was occurring in-flight during parachute deployment
  - When removing CFT (unflown) parachutes, ALL horizontal retention strap D-Rings were observed to have some degree of bending. None of the vertical retention strap D-Rings were bent.
  - RCCA Investigation:
    - D-Rings position during final press w/ loads up to 100Klb force is different than assumed
    - Rings under riser plate during packing is determined as the root cause of the CFT Bent D-Rings
    - Fixture modified to remove rings from load path; procedures modified to inspect rings for flatness
      - Post-packing / pre-integration onto the Spacecraft
- Next steps
  - Conducted NPCQT-02 with parachutes packed per new processes; Complete 1/9/2024
  - Perform video and strain analysis, including retention system loads and timing: Complete 2/14/2024
  - Final inspection of test D-rings (4x) as FLAT post-test; Complete
  - Continue to monitor parachute performance (ongoing surveillance)
  - IFA closed for CFT+ at JPCB; Complete 2/14/2024

Internal ASAP Use Only



CIII//SP\_EVPT/SP\_PPOPIN//DL-ONIV

# Commercial Crew Program Status to ASAP

### Steve Stich Manager, Commercial Crew Program May 10, 2022

**EAR99:** This document contains data within the purview of the U.S. Export Administration Regulations (EAR), 15 CFR 730-774. The document may be used only in the International Space Station (ISS) program to fulfill responsibilities of the Parties or of a Cooperating Agency of an ISS Partner in furtherance of the ISS Intergovernmental Agreement. Re-transfer or disclosure to, or use by, any persons other than citizens of ISS Program International Partner countries, or use for any other purpose, requires prior U.S. Government authorization.



#### CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74C / Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government makes such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure.

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract. (c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel.

MAY CONTAIN PROPRIETARY AND/OR LIMITED RIGHTS DATA, NOT YET REVIEWED FOR EXPORT CONTROL



# CFT Top Issue Summary Table (1 of 2)



Issue	Summary	Closure Plan or Next Step for CFT	
OFT-2 Anomaly Investigation	13 of 24 SM oxidizer isolation valves failed to open prior to OFT-2 launch. Root cause might drive CFT SM re-work.	Wait for conclusion of OFT-2 Anomaly Investigation Team and implement required mitigations for CFT.	
Parachutes	Main parachutes do not have required factors of safety when accounting for asymmetry loading. Parachute loads not expected to meet the factors of safety with the current con-ops for 1a aborts	Single flight use of Starliner main parachutes for CFT and procuring new build main parachutes for PCM-1 and subs. Finalizing closure plan for remaining technical issues	
LAE Fault Tolerance	LAE pre-valve and main valves are 0FT to leakage during pre-launch and ascent and 1FT while in free flight and docked; potential ISS contamination	Conceptual designs complete. Testing of leak detection sensors to begin May 3 and run through May 17. Schedule assessment of Leak Overboard option shows significant risk to closure by CFT. Down select briefing to program in early May.	
Landing Loads & Landing System Complexity	Potential for excessive landing loads (both hardware and crew injury) due to (1) Potential Limit Cycle or Medium Pendulum motion during descent can cause load exceedances (2) Boeing approach to landing margins do not allow easy assessment of increased loads	Perform parachute testing to define pendulum model Boeing/NASA working to concur to initial conditions Analysis to be conducted when pendulum tests are complete Feasibility assessment in work for Gantry test if required.	
Lightweight Service Module Model Correlation	The CM Starliner FEM is fully correlated, but the full stack (CM+SM) model is not correlated. Modal test completed with heavyweight SM, but full model correlation was not obtained making transition to lightweight SM difficult analytically. CFT will fly lightweight SM.	Meeting held 2/4 to discuss testing forward paths; Boeing agree gap exists Evaluating SM2 for modal testing options	
Abort Loads Analysis	Risk that both primary and secondary structure (tanks, batteries, crew seats, e.g.) cannot withstand abort loads. This risk is due to differences in statistical binning of load cases which can cause un-conservative loads for which structure is evaluated.	Closure plan for CFT is for Boeing to assess primary structure load indicators with exceedances greater than 5%	
Hazard Report Process	Need to increase efficiency and integration of safety, engineering, and operations to enable success of Phase III HRs for CFT	OCFT tactical plans complete; CFT kickoff held 8/25; CCP/ISS agreed to hold parallel boards	
Bold indicates issue ioint with ISS			
	MAY CONTAIN PROPRIETARY AND/OR LIMITED RIGHTS DATA; NOT YET	TREVIEWED FOR EXPORT CONTROL 26	





# IssueSummaryParachutesMain parachutes do not have required factors of safety when accounting for asymmetry<br/>loading. Parachute loads not expected to meet the factors of safety with the current con-<br/>ops for 1a abortsSingle factors of safety when accounting for asymmetry<br/>new bu<br/>for rem

Single flight use of Starliner main parachutes for CFT+ waiver Procuring new build main parachutes for PCM-1 and subs. Finalizing closure plan for remaining technical issues

**Closure Plan or Next Step for CF1** 

- FHS parachute technical discussion complete
  - Boeing in process of shipping chute to NASA
- Over-Q test work progressing
  - Dart updates / refurbishment progressing on schedule in Yuma
  - Boeing identifying assets for test (drogue/pilot/main chutes and mortars)
    - Parachute deliveries from Boeing delayed / not on contract jeopardizing schedule – been discussed with (b) (6), (b) (4)
- PCM 1+ SOW design down selecting final design solution
  - Changes limited to those that do not require delta qual testing
  - Working on presentation for ERB 5/9, PCB 5/12
- Drogue packing hardware/testing awaiting SOW
- VCN plan/deliveries continue to be delayed





CIII//SD\_EVPT/SD\_DDODIN//DI\_ONIV

# Commercial Crew Program Status to ASAP

### Steve Stich Program Manager, Commercial Crew Program May 24, 2023

#### ITAR Category XV, (f), ECCN 9E515.a, EAR99 NLR

- International Traffic in Arms Regulations (ITAR) Notice -

This document contains information which falls under the purview of the U.S. Munitions List (USML) as defined in the International Traffic in Arms Regulations (ITAR), 22 CFR 120-130, and is export controlled. It shall not be transferred to foreign nationals in the U.S. or abroad without specific approval of a knowledgeable NASA export control official, and/or unless an export license or license exemption is obtained/available from the United States Department of State. Violations of these regulations are punishable by fine, imprisonment, or both. Reference EDR Log #: 13500 NASA KSC Export Control Office, (321) 867-9209

#### CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74C / Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government may disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure. (b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government to in ald ata first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract.

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract. (c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel, and Aerospace Safety Advisory Panel

unless marked otherwise.





# **CFT / PCM Parachute Design and Cert**



### Parachute Team executing to plan for closure for CFT with low technical risk

### Current Status

- CFT and PCM-1+ parachute system designs have been baselined
- For PCM-1+ implementing a change to the joint design at each radial to suspension line attachment, improves margin
- Parachute Verification and Hazard Reports are a pacing item for CFT
  - An additional ground test will be conducted in May related to deployment of the Forward Heat Shield parachute to obtain data points needed for verification
     Available for Public Discussion

### Closure Status acceptability

- Pneumatic mortar testing to complete validation of drogue packing change completed 2/10/2023
- Retention system IFA closure: Testing and analysis closed at PCB on 5/18/2023
- Forward Heatshield Parachute (FHSP) high dynamic pressure testing scheduled for 6/7/2023

### • Path Forward & Flight Rationale

- VCN Closure: Boeing has submitted all closure paperwork and NASA has reviewed
   Boeing currently updating products to close comments; ECD 5/31/2023
- Hazard Reports: STRB Phase III occurred 5/18/2023 with standard forward work to close for CFT
- CFT Parachutes
  - NASA and Boeing presented final margin position to PCB on 5/2/2023
  - Program and all Technical Authorities accepted CFT margins, including degradation factor for single parachute that had been packed 3¼ times
- PCM-1+ Parachute design change has been concurred
  - Final margins under review
  - Materials being received: ECD of four parachutes (3x for PCM-1 shipset 8/31/2023 + 1x for Single Canopy Airdrop Test 11/15/2023)
    - $_{\circ}$   $\,$  Airdrop test scheduled for early January 2024  $\,$

Internal ASAP Use Only





# **CST-100 Drogue and Main Low Margin**



### Background

-	(b) (4)	
-	(b) (4)	
		1.00
	(b) (4)	

### Status

- Upon final review of their Design Analysis Report, parachute vendor (Airborne Systems) noted only two valid test samples to determine strength of this item – this testing had strength at 79% efficiency
- Airborne performed required testing to determine strength (May 2023)
- New testing with 10 samples as required showed 38% efficiency
- This hardware / joint is considered "safety critical" and requires FOS = 2.0

### Path Forward

- All three teams (Airborne / Boeing / NASA) are evaluating flight data, test setup and test results for conservativism
- Final margins are being evaluated for impacts to CFT

Parachute Team evaluating impacts to final margin

Internal ASAP Use Only



CUI//SP\_EYPT/SP\_PPOPIN//DL\_ONLY

# Commercial Crew Program Status to ASAP

### Steve Stich Program Manager, Commercial Crew Program October 25, 2023

#### ITAR Category IV (i)

- International Traffic in Arms Regulations (ITAR) Notice -

This document contains information which falls under the purview of the U.S. Munitions List (USML) as defined in the International Traffic in Arms Regulations (ITAR), 22 CFR 120-130, and is export controlled. It shall not be transferred to foreign nationals in the U.S. or abroad without specific approval of a knowledgeable NASA export control official, and/or unless an export license or license exemption is obtained/available from the United States Department of State. Violations of these regulations are punishable by fine, imprisonment, or both. Reference EDR Log #: 14840 NASA KSC Export Control Office, (321) 867-9209

#### CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74C / Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government may such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure. (b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government to in part at private expense in performance of this contract.

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract. (c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel, and Aerospace Safety Advisory Panel

unless marked otherwise.





# CST-100 Drogue and Main Low Margin – Soft Links

(b) (4)



#### Public Status:

Available for Public Discussion

- Preparations underway for an upcoming drop test of Starliner's upgraded drogue and main parachutes.
- New parachutes will incorporate planned strengthening of main canopy suspension lines and recent redesign of
  drogue and main parachute soft-link joints, which will increase the safety factor for the system.

#### Background:

- Airborne had been using old CEV Parachute Assembly System (CPAS) data / seam and joint testing with 72% efficiency
  - Testing was from 2009, configuration was incorrect for CST-100 application
  - Airborne found error upon final "scrub" of report for Verification Change Notification (VCN) submittal
  - (b) (4)
- Status:
  - (b) (4)
  - (b) (4)
  - (b) (4)
  - (b) (4)
  - **(b)** (4)
  - 。 (b) (4)
  - (b) (4)
  - (b) (4)
- Path Forward:
  - All parachutes being reworked to the corrected shorter configuration w/ positive margins Root Cause and Corrective Action (RCCA) in work
  - Parachutes for drop testing on schedule to support test, planned for January 2024
  - Parachutes for CFT on schedule to support spacecraft install

Internal ASAP Use Only



# **CST-100 Parachute System Airdrop Test**

- Background:
  - (b) (4)
  - Upgraded soft links require airdrop test to verify / validate performance
  - Use of the "heavy dart" parachute compartment drop test vehicle (PCDTV) requires two mains for successful recovery of the test article



- Retention system / D-ring will be flight-like for both parachutes
- Status:
  - Testing planned for week of 1/8/24 at Yuma Proving Ground (YPG)
  - Instrumentation will allow for parachute loads measurement, loads measurement of the retention system and timing of the D-ring release
  - \_ (b) (4)
- Forward Work:
  - Parachute delivery to Yuma for integration currently scheduled for November 2023

Internal ASAP Use Only

### Airdrop Test Conops







# NASA Quick Look GAO for Commercial Crew Program

Steve Stich Manager, Commercial Crew Program July 27, 2022

**EAR99:** This document contains data within the purview of the U.S. Export Administration Regulations (EAR), 15 CFR 730-774. The document may be used only in the International Space Station (ISS) program to fulfill responsibilities of the Parties or of a Cooperating Agency of an ISS Partner in furtherance of the ISS Intergovernmental Agreement. Re-transfer or disclosure to, or use by, any persons other than citizens of ISS Program International Partner countries, or use for any other purpose, requires prior U.S. Government authorization.



#### CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74C / Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government makes such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure.

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract. (c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel.

- MAY CONTAIN PROPRIETARY AND/OR LIMITED RIGHTS BATA, NOT YET REVIEWED FOR EXPORT CONTROL



Limited Rights - Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel.



Limited Rights - Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel.

**Boeing Slide** 

# **CFT Parachute Forward Work (3 of 3)**



# CUI

### ATTENTION

Use this space to judicate categories, located dissumination controls, spacial instructions, points of contact, etc., of model.

#### CUI // SP- EXPT//PROPIN/D-ONLY CUI // SP- FNC-SP//PROPIN/DL-ONLY

CUI Designation by CCP

Please Contact: David Allega david.b.allega@nasa.gov

#### ATTENTION

All individuals handling this information are required to protect it from unauthorized disclosure.

Handling, storage, reproduction, and disposition of the attached document(s) must be in accordance with 32 CFR Part 2002 and applicable agency policy.

Access to and dissemmation of Controlled Unclassified Information shall be allowed as necessary and permissible to any individual(s), organization(s), or grouping(s) of users, provided such access or dissemmation is consistent with or in furtherance of a Lawful Government Purpose and in a manner consistent with applicable law, regulations, and Government-wide policies.

Manadami Perso Min (12 14).

Page 1



# SPACE OPERATIONS MISSION DIRECTORATE (SOMD)

Major Program Review August 25, 2022



# **Major Program Review**

12

Commercial Space Division (CSD) Commercial Crew Program (CCP) Overview Phil McAlister, CSD Division Director

# **CCP** Technical Top Issues



### **Boeing Starliner Top Issues Review**

### **December 2, 2022**

CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government makes such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure.

CCT-T-4003

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract.

(c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel.



# In Flight Anomaly Summary



Title	Open / Closed	Description	Progress / Status	Expected Disposition Date
	0			
12/2/2022		MAY CONTAIN PROPRIETARY AND/OR HMITED RIGHTS F	ATA NOT YET REVIEWED FOR EXPORT CONTROL	13





12/2/2022

-MAY-CONTAIN-PROPRIETARY AND/OR-LIMITED-RIGHTS-DATA-NOT-YET-REVIEWED-FOR-EXPORT-CONTROL-



# CFT Top Issue Summary Table (1 of 2)





Issue	Summary	Closure Plan or Next Step for CFT	Trend	Prior/Now
OFT-2 Anomaly Investigation	13 of 24 SM oxidizer isolation valves failed to open prior to OFT-2 launch. Root cause might drive CFT SM re-work.	Successful remediation during OFT2 flight. Same approach planned for CFT. Boeing working PCM-2 design changes	-	
Parachutes	Main parachutes do not have required factors of safety when accounting for asymmetry loading. Parachute loads not expected to meet the factors of safety with the current con-ops for 1a aborts	Single flight use of Starliner main parachutes for CFT and procuring new build main parachutes for PCM-1 and subs (at risk). Over-Q test completed 11/15. VCN delivery plan in work. Attempting to partner on closure plan for FHS over-Q test gap.	<b>→</b>	
LAE Fault Tolerance	LAE pre-valve and main valves are 0FT to leakage during pre-launch and ascent and 1FT while in free flight and docked; potential ISS contamination	HALO design review complete. Analysis of leak detection sensors I/W. Schedule assessment of sensor system installation shows low risk to closure by CFT. LCC/FLT rule needs to be partnered.	1	
Landing Loads & Landing System Complexity	Potential for excessive landing loads (both hardware and crew injury) due to (1) Potential Medium Pendulum motion or yaw angles during descent can cause load exceedances (2) Boeing approach to landing margins do not allow easy assessment of increased loads (3) Boeing loads analysis campaign schedule being assisted with NASA computational assets to bring in completion date to the left	Initial results of Boeing Loads Analysis show Starliner may be able to support an 8 knot CFT landing wind placard. Analysis campaign expected to be complete NET mid-Dec and completion of Landing Loads IV&V and HHP occupant protection analyses expected NET 2/24/23. Hardware modifications are expected for PCM-1.	+	
Service Module Modal Correlation	The CM Starliner FEM is fully correlated, but the full stack (CM+SM) model is not correlated. Modal test originally completed with heavyweight SM, but full model correlation was not obtained making transition to lightweight SM difficult analytically. CFT will fly lightweight SM.	Modal testing with lightweight SM completed. Correlation efforts I/W. Should complete in December.	1	
Abort Loads Analysis	Risk that both primary and secondary structure (tanks, batteries, crew seats, e.g.) cannot withstand abort loads. This risk is due to differences in statistical binning of load cases which can cause un-conservative loads for which structure is evaluated.	All data has been received. Boeing has agreed to assess all primary structure components with load indicator increases > 5%. Engineering judgement assessment is that impacts will be small. Boeing stress assessment ECD of late November	-	
Hazard Report Process	Need to increase efficiency and integration of safety, engineering, and operations to enable success of Phase III HRs for CFT	CFT tactical plans continue to be updated as deliveries have slipped. Dual STRBs in operation. Boeing SW PR process improved. Parachute HR being reworked. Estimating final STRB in February.	-	
Bold indicates issue jo	int with ISS -MAY-CONTAIN-PROPRIETARY-AND/OR-LIMITED-RIGI-ITS-D/	TA, NOT YET REVIEWED FOR EXPORT CONTROL	_	41



# **Boeing CFT Top Issues**

### Dan Bell Associate Administrator Briefing 25 February 2022

CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74/ Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government makes such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure.

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have

Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract.

(c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel.

MAY CONTAIN PROPRIETARY AND/OR LIMITED RIGHTS DATA, NOT REVIEWED FOR EXPORT CONTROL





# CFT Top Issue Summary Table (1 of 2)



NASA

Issue	Summary	Closure Plan or Next Step for CFT	Trend Pri	ior/Now
OFT-2 Anomaly Investigation	13 of 24 SM oxidizer isolation valves failed to open prior to OFT-2 launch. Root cause might drive CFT SM re-work.	Wait for conclusion of OFT-2 Anomaly Investigation Team and implement required mitigations for CFT.	1	
Parachutes	Main parachutes do not have required factors of safety when accounting for asymmetry loading. Parachute loads not expected to meet the factors of safety with the current con-ops for 1a aborts	Single flight use of Starliner main parachutes for CFT and procuring new build main parachutes for PCM-1 and subs. Finalizing closure plan for remaining technical issues		
LAE Fault Tolerance	LAE pre-valve and main valves are 0FT to leakage during pre-launch and ascent and 1FT while in free flight and docked; potential ISS contamination	TIM complete. Initial tasks identifying options for forward path mitigation of potential leakage are in work	1	
Landing Loads & Landing System Complexity	Potential for excessive landing loads (both hardware and crew injury) due to (1) Potential Limit Cycle or Medium Pendulum motion during descent can cause load exceedances (2) Boeing approach to landing margins do not allow easy assessment of increased loads	Perform parachute testing to define pendulum model Boeing/NASA working to concur to initial conditions Analysis to be conducted when pendulum tests are complete Feasibility assessment in work for Gantry test if required.	1	
Lightweight Service Module Model Correlation	The CM Starliner FEM is fully correlated, but the full stack (CM+SM) model is not correlated. Modal test completed with heavyweight SM, but full model correlation was not obtained making transition to lightweight SM difficult analytically. CFT will fly lightweight SM.	Meeting held 2/4 to discuss testing forward paths; Boeing agree gap exists Evaluating SM2 for modal testing options	-	
Abort Loads Analysis	Risk that both primary and secondary structure (tanks, batteries, crew seats, e.g.) cannot withstand abort loads. This risk is due to differences in statistical binning of load cases which can cause un-conservative loads for which structure is evaluated.	Closure plan for CFT is for Boeing to assess primary structure load indicators with exceedances greater than 5%		
Hazard Report Process	Need to increase efficiency and integration of safety, engineering, and operations to enable success of Phase III HRs for CFT	CFT tactical plans complete; CFT kickoff held 8/25; CCP/ISS agreed to hold parallel boards	⇒	

**Bold** indicates issue joint with ISS

MAY-CONTAIN PROPRIETARY AND/OR-LIMITED RIGHTS DATA, NOT YET REVIEWED FOR EXPORT CONTROL

NASA POC



### Main Parachute Loading and FHS Drogue Chute Debris

Jim McMichael Summarv **Closure Plan or Next Step for CFT** Trend Mitigation SSUE Main parachutes do not have required factors of safety when accounting for Single flight use of Starliner main parachutes for CFT+ waiver Parachutes asymmetry loading. Parachute loads not expected to meet the factors of safety Procuring new build main parachutes for PCM-1 and subs. with the current con-ops for 1a aborts Finalizing closure plan for remaining technical issues FHS parachute technical discussion Complete • Boeing investigation complete, damaged FHSP to be provided to NASA NASA will perform additional testing for CFT risk acceptance PAT parachute inspections in Yuma complete Drogue parachutes currently can not be located, will need to be ٠ inspected at a future date High Alt. Abort variance discussed at the AIWG on 1/26/22 Cases above Mach 0.8 do not impact abort performance • PCB on 3/10 Dart movement from WSMR to Yuma completed Feb 18<sup>th</sup> VCN compliance matrix/VCN deliveries deliveries delayed Drogue packing SOW returned to Boeing Final VCN **Drogue Ground** 







### Dan Bell July 13, 2022

CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74/ Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government makes such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure.

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have

Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract.

(c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel.

MAY CONTAIN PROPRIETARY AND/OR LIMITED RIGHTS DATA, NOT REVIEWED FOR EXPORT CONTROL





•

# OFT / CFT / PCM Parachute Design and Cert

Issue	Summary	Closure Plan or Next Step for CFT	Trend Mitigation
irachutes	Main parachutes do not have required factors of safety when accounting for asymmetry loading. Parachute loads not expected to meet the factors of safety with the current con-ops for 1a aborts	Single flight use of Starliner main parachutes for CFT and procuring new build main parachutes for PCM-1 and subs (at risk due to supply chain issues). Attempting to partner on closure plan for remaining technical issues	<b>→</b>

**Boeing POC** 

Louis Atchison

NASA POC

Mark Dub

- OFT-1 FHSP Chute damage investigation completed. Unexplained anomaly. Flight rationale in work.
- Over-Q test work progressing Path to closure on Drogues/Mains. Investigating previous FHSP test data to determine if path to closure on FHSP.
  - Boeing has identified OFT-1 chutes for delivery, require refurb and update, Expecting delivery of chutes 8/7, test targeting 9/13
- Drogue package change: ground pneumatic test and flight test (Over-q test) in work.
- CFT main installed at risk, pending data on 3x repack and responses to PAA Finding Letters (3)
  - Boeing running subscale packing test to quantify knockdown. Expect path to close.
- OFT-2 Parachute Inspection
  - Boeing putting Airborne on contract to do inspection date TBD
- Began meeting weekly on VCN (philosophical until VCN delivery) and HR (identifying gaps in Controls), Boeing now plans VCN delivery NLT 8/26 with possible incremental deliveries. Based on initial VCN meetings, expect lengthy path to closure due to extensive disconnects, such as asymmetry modeling.
- PCM 1+ SOW design down selecting final design solution -PCB 5/18 approved baseline changes for FOS > 1.6 for NEW CHUTES
  - Boeing continues to evaluate new outer radial material for REUSE
    - Outer radial change would require additional full scale flight tests
- PCM-1 Main Chute plan, Boeing communicated inability to provide new design for Aug 2023 launch date





# Commercial Crew Program Status to ASAP

Steve Stich Manager, Commercial Crew Program January 26, 2022



CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74C / Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government makes such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure.

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract. (c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel.



## CFT Top Issue Summary Table (1 of 2)





Issue	Summary	Closure Plan or Next Step for CFT	Trend	<b>Prior/Now</b>
OFT-2 Anomaly Investigation	13 of 24 SM oxidizer isolation valves failed to open prior to OFT-2 launch. Root cause might drive CFT SM re-work.	Wait for conclusion of OFT-2 Anomaly Investigation Team and implement required mitigations for CFT	1	
Parachutes	Main parachutes do not have required factors of safety when accounting for asymmetry loading. Parachute loads not expected to meet the factors of safety with the current con-ops for 1a aborts	Single flight use of Starliner main parachutes for CFT and procuring new build main parachutes for PCM-1 and subs. Finalizing closure plan for remaining technical issues	1	
LAE Fault Tolerance	LAE pre-valve and main valves are 0FT to leakage during pre-launch and ascent and 1FT while in free flight and docked; potential ISS contamination	TIM complete. Initial tasks identifying options for forward path mitigation of potential leakage are in work	1	
Landing Loads & Landing System Complexity	Potential for excessive landing loads (both hardware and crew injury) due to (1) Potential Limit Cycle or Medium Pendulum motion during descent can cause load exceedances (2) Boeing approach to landing margins do not allow easy assessment of increased loads	Perform parachute testing to define pendulum model Boeing/NASA working to concur to initial conditions Analysis to be conducted when pendulum tests are complete Feasibility assessment in work for Gantry test if required.	1	
Lightweight Service Module Model Correlation	The CM Starliner FEM is fully correlated, but the full stack (CM+SM) model is not correlated. Modal test completed with heavyweight SM, but full model correlation was not obtained making transition to lightweight SM difficult analytically. CFT will fly lightweight SM.	Abort trade studies in work by NASA to define risk and provide justification for modal test; results expected Sept 2021. Meeting held 9/17 with Boeing to discuss analysis and/or testing forward paths; Boeing agrees gap exists. Evaluating SM-2 or SM6 for test.	1	
Abort Loads Analysis	Risk that both primary and secondary structure (tanks, batteries, crew seats, e.g.) cannot withstand abort loads. This risk is due to differences in statistical binning of load cases which can cause un-conservative loads for which structure is evaluated.	Closure plan for CFT is for Boeing to assess primary structure load indicators with exceedances greater than 5%	1	
Hazard Report Process	Need to increase efficiency and integration of safety, engineering, and operations to enable success of Phase III HRs for CFT	CFT tactical plans complete; CFT kickoff held 8/25; CCP/ISS agreed to hold parallel boards	-	

Bold indicates issue joint with ISS

-MAX-CONTAIN-PROPRIETARY AND/OR-LIMITED RIGHTS DATA, NOT YET REVIEWED FOR EXPORT CONTROL



# **Boeing Main Parachute Status (1 of 2)**





# Main Parachute Path to Certification (2 of 2)

- Boeing and NASA have developed plans and schedules to complete the remaining work required for CFT
  - Risk evaluation is being performed on a drogue mortar qualification deviation
  - Planning is in work for final qualification testing for a drogue parachute packing change
  - Agreement to conduct a High Q drop test using a Dart test article – complete parachute standard test requirements - planning in work
- Important delivery of draft VCN required end of Jan to assure full scope of work is understood for closure

### Parachute Certification Milestones





# Commercial Crew Program Status to ASAP

### Steve Stich Manager, Commercial Crew Program July 20, 2022

**EAR99:** This document contains data within the purview of the U.S. Export Administration Regulations (EAR), 15 CFR 730-774. The document may be used only in the International Space Station (ISS) program to fulfill responsibilities of the Parties or of a Cooperating Agency of an ISS Partner in furtherance of the ISS Intergovernmental Agreement. Re-transfer or disclosure to, or use by, any persons other than citizens of ISS Program International Partner countries, or use for any other purpose, requires prior U.S. Government authorization.



#### CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74C / Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government makes such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure.

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract. (c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel.

MAY CONTAIN PROPRIETARY AND/OR LIMITED RIGHTS DATA: NOT YET REVIEWED FOR EXPORT CONTROL



# CFT Top Issue Summary Table (1 of 2)

and the second se		
Issue	Summary	Closure Plan or Next Step for CFT
OFT-2 Anomaly Investigation	13 of 24 SM oxidizer isolation valves failed to open prior to OFT-2 launch. Root cause might drive CFT SM re-work.	Successful remediation during OFT2 flight. Same approach planned for CFT. Boeing working design changes with Mfg
Parachutes	Main parachutes do not have required factors of safety when accounting for asymmetry loading. Parachute loads not expected to meet the factors of safety with the current con-ops for 1a aborts	Single flight use of Starliner main parachutes for CFT and procuring new build main parachutes for PCM-1 and subs (at risk due to supply chain issues). Attempting to partner on closure plan for remaining technical issues
LAE Fault Tolerance	LAE pre-valve and main valves are 0FT to leakage during pre-launch and ascent and 1FT while in free flight and docked; potential ISS contamination	Conceptual designs complete. Testing of leak detection sensors to begin July 18 and run through July 30. Schedule assessment of Leak Overboard option shows significant risk to closure by CFT. Down select briefing to program 7/5.
Landing Loads & Landing System Complexity	Potential for excessive landing loads (both hardware and crew injury) due to (1) Potential Medium Pendulum motion or yaw angles during descent can cause load exceedances (2) Boeing approach to landing margins do not allow easy assessment of increased loads (3) Boeing loads analysis campaign schedule being assisted with NASA computational assets to bring in completion date to the left	Parachute modelling update based on NMPAT testing is complete and analysis in work. Additional conditions including yaw being incorporated in analysis prior to CFT Assessment in work for Gantry test if required.
Service Module Modal Correlation	The CM Starliner FEM is fully correlated, but the full stack (CM+SM) model is not correlated. Modal test completed with heavyweight SM, but full model correlation was not obtained making transition to lightweight SM difficult analytically. CFT will fly lightweight SM.	SM2 to ship to WSTF on 7/7 Modal testing planned in September with first review of results within 2 months of test
Abort Loads Analysis	Risk that both primary and secondary structure (tanks, batteries, crew seats, e.g.) cannot withstand abort loads. This risk is due to differences in statistical binning of load cases which can cause un-conservative loads for which structure is evaluated.	Closure plan for CFT is for Boeing to assess primary structure load indicators with exceedances greater than 5%
Hazard Report Process	Need to increase efficiency and integration of safety, engineering, and operations to enable success of Phase III HRs for CFT	CFT tactical plans complete. Dual STRBs in operation. Boeing SW PR process improved. Boeing VTL improved. SW Safety Assessments aligned to HR deliveries.
Bold indicates issue joint	with ISS	DT YET REVIEWED FOR EXPORT CONTROL 55



•

# OFT / CFT / PCM Parachute Design and Cert



Issue	Summary	Closure Plan or Next Step for CFT
Parachutes	Main parachutes do not have required factors of safety when accounting for asymmetry	Single flight use of Starliner main parachutes for CFT and procuring new build
	ops for 1a aborts	Attempting to partner on closure plan for remaining technical issues

- OFT-1 FHSP Chute damage investigation completed. Unexplained anomaly. Flight rationale in work.
  - Over-Q test work progressing Path to closure on Drogues/Mains. Investigating previous FHSP test data to determine if path to closure on FHSP.
    - Boeing has identified OFT-1 chutes for delivery, require refurb and update, Expecting delivery of chutes 8/7, test targeting 9/13
- Drogue package change: ground pneumatic test and flight test (Over-q test) in work.
- CFT main installed at risk, pending data on 3x repack and responses to PAA Finding Letters (3)
  - Boeing running subscale packing test to quantify knockdown. Expect path to close.
- OFT-2 Parachute Inspection
  - Boeing putting Airborne on contract to do inspection date TBD
- Began meeting weekly on VCN (philosophical until VCN delivery) and HR (identifying gaps in Controls), Boeing now plans VCN delivery NLT 8/26 with possible incremental deliveries. Based on initial VCN meetings, expect lengthy path to closure due to extensive disconnects, such as asymmetry modeling.
- PCM 1+ SOW design down selecting final design solution -PCB 5/18 approved baseline changes for FOS > 1.6 for NEW CHUTES
  - Boeing continues to evaluate new outer radial material for REUSE
    - Outer radial change would require additional full scale flight tests
- PCM-1 Main Chute plan, Boeing communicated inability to provide new design for Aug 2023 launch date





ITAR Category XV, (f), ECCN 9E515.a, EAR99 NLR

- International Traffic in Arms Regulations (ITAR) Notice -

This document contains information which falls under the purview of the U.S. Munitions List (USML) as defined in the International Traffic in Arms Regulations (ITAR), 22 CFR 120-130, and is export controlled. It shall not be transferred to foreign nationals in the U.S. or abroad without specific approval of a knowledgeable NASA export control official, and/or unless an export license or license exemption is obtained/available from the United States Department of State. Violations of these regulations are punishable by fine, imprisonment, or both. Reference EDR Log #: 12945 NASA KSC Export Control Office, (321) 867-9209 CCCCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74C / Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government makes such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure.

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract. (c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel, and Aerospace Safety Advisory Panel.





### **OFT / CFT / PCM Parachute Design and Cert**



Issue	Summary	Closure Plan or Next Step for CFT
Parachutes	Main parachutes do not have required factors of safety when accounting for asymmetry loading. Parachute loads not expected to meet the factors of safety with the current con-ops for 1a aborts	Single flight use of Starliner main parachutes for CFT and procuring new build main parachutes for PCM-1 and subs (at risk due to supply chain issues). Attempting to partner on closure plan for remaining technical issues

- OFT-1 FHSP Chute damage investigation completed. Unexplained anomaly. Flight rationale in work.
- Over-Q test work progressing Path to closure on NPCQT-01 (Drogues/Mains Over-Q Test) targeting NET 11/14.
  - Investigation of previous FHSP test data to determine if path to closure on FHSP is complete and NASA has determined test data did not demonstrate FHSP deployment in Over-Q conditions. Test proposal at PCB 10/28.
- Drogue package change: ground and flight test (NPCQT-01) in work. Bench strip test completed 9/9, Pneumatic Mortar test NET November.
- CFT main installed at risk, pending data on 3x repack and responses to PAA Finding Letters (3):
  - Boeing running subscale packing test to quantify knockdown. Boeing advised 10/11/22 test completion at risk prior to February 2023 CFT launch date.
- OFT-2 Parachute Inspection Postflight OEM inspection complete. No significant damage was reported in-process. Final report delivered 10/18/22.
- Began meeting weekly on VCN (philosophical until VCN delivery) and HR (identifying gaps in Hazard Controls). Boeing recently added resources to support VCN delivery: Was 9/30/22. Revised planning in work. Planned delivery now November 2022 with possible incremental deliveries earlier. Based on initial VCN meetings and analogous certification experience, expecting ~6-month review cycle for closure.
- PCM-1+ SOW design downselecting final design solution. PCB-22-187 approved baseline changes for FOS > 1.6 for NEW (first-flight) parachutes PCM-1+.
   Boeing continues to evaluate new outer radial material for REUSE; change would require additional full scale flight tests.
- PCM-1 Main Chute production: Boeing communicated inability to provide new design for Aug 2023 launch date due to supply chain issues.
- Earliest available shipset for PCM-1 from vendor on-dock at Boeing NET 9/30/2023. Parachutes required on-dock NET L-minus 6 months to install.



# Commercial Crew Program Status to GAO for Quick Look Book (#105212)

### Steve Stich Manager, Commercial Crew Program January 19, 2022

CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74C / Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government; except that the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government makes such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure.

(b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in

Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense performance of this contract.

(c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel.



# **Boeing Parachute Status**



### **Asymmetry Parachute Testing**

• (b)(3)	Test Number	Asymmetry	Pendulum
= (b)(3)	NMPAT 01	х	
- (b)(3)	NMPAT 02	Х	
	NMPAT 03	Х	
<ul> <li>Prior material canabilities used in margin calculations were based on a factors (</li> </ul>	NMPAT 04	Х	
• Filor indicidal capabilities used in margin calculations were based on a factors of material apparentiation and joint officiancy.	NMPAT 05	Х	
material spec capability, and joint enciency	NMPAT 06	Х	
- CCP has introduced utilizing A-basis material calculations for the parachute joints measuring	NMPAT 07	Х	Х
Actual Statistical Capability Derechute conchilition were measured on ground test and flight percebutes to include	NMPAT 08	Х	х
- Parachule capabilities were measured on ground lest and hight parachules to include	NMPAT 09	X	Х
environmental exposures	NMPAT 10	х	х
CCP test efforts are leading to a more accurate understanding of margin for CCP crews, but have also expanded the knowledge basis for successful design and certification of future NASA program parachute systems	NMPAT 11	X	X

## **Boeing Parachute Status**

### **Boeing Main Parachute Status**

### Application of data collected for Boeing Margins

- Significant improvement on understanding of Boeing parachute margins
- Multiple tests conducted to measure asymmetry targeting high riser loads
  - Additional asymmetry data collection allowed refinement of models
- Boeing/NASA TIM allowed alignment of assumptions for the margins assessment
  - Some differences remain in the analysis approach, but Boeing margins essentially align with those calculated by the NASA parachute team
- NASA technical teams agree that with the current margins, no major redesign of the Boeing main parachute is required. Approved at PCB on September 15, 2021.
  - Boeing parachutes will be only used for a single use
  - New parachute builds will explore higher strength materials and minor joint modification opportunities to reduce/eliminate the remaining negative margins

Significant progress has been made on the understanding of the parachute margins. No major redesign of the main parachutes will be required.







# **Boeing Parachute Status – Forward Path**



- NASA/Boeing evaluating the remaining work required for certification
  - CFT Main Parachute Modifications and Joint Qualification
    - NASA Identified a high-confidence redesign option for the Boeing Mains arming lanyard joint that has been tested in recent NMPAT tests
    - Airborne will retrofit the design into the CFT mains (removing the 2K lines) and perform joint testing on their final implementation to verify performance
  - Boeing High Altitude Abort Variance
    - Addresses gap between potential abort altitude and drop tests
    - NASA team is reviewing supporting data provided by Boeing
  - FHS Chute Damage incurred on OFT-1 (Night Landing)
    - Possible causes Jettisoned HW recontact or unknown debris
    - CCP has funded WB-57 landing imagery for OFT-2
  - Drogue Packing Procedure Modification
    - Damage on PCRT-3 test due to RLC hang up on skirt band, D-Bag liner
    - Evaluating scope of Ground Testing that will confirm effectiveness of procedure change, remaining risk acceptance (no system level tests)
  - Dynamic pressure requirement compliance
    - (b)(3)
    - Will require an overload test, or risk acceptance for the rare (abort + drogue failure) case
  - Main Chute Restraint System Changes (Bent D-ring) Complete
    - CFT restraint system must be replaced to eliminate issues
    - Eliminates possibility of D-ring yielding enough to prevent the release of D-bag and creating a pilot parachute in tow with no main out
    - Partnered Ground test campaign will verify changes, remaining risk acceptance (no system level tests)





# **Boeing Parachute Status – Forward Path**



### **Remaining Parachute Drop Test Campaign**

- Highly successful NMPAT test campaign generating both
   Asymmetry and Pendulum data
  - NASA team including a mass drop in pendulum tests 7-11 allowing secondary objective asymmetry data to be collected
  - Reducing uncertainty/improving margins

### Pendulum tests conducted have not generated limit cycle pendulum

- Tests represent real vehicle mass
- Low wind conditions during the drops
- Remaining 2 tests held to winter (Dec-Jan) to assure envelope of available winds are tested
- Single additional drop test to address the higher Q limit identified for aborts may be required to close out Boeing Parachute certification



### **IV&V CFT Schedule**

### Kim Ess Integrated Performance

### 07/13/22

COMMERCIAL OREW CCtCap LIMITED RIGHTS NOTICE (DEC 2007) (DEVIATION)

(a) These data are submitted with limited rights under Government Contract No. SpaceX NNK14MA74C / Boeing NNK14MA75C. These data may be reproduced and used by the Government with the express limitation that they will not, without written permission of the Contractor, be used for purposes of manufacture nor disclosed outside the Government may disclose these data outside the Government to support service contractors and/or pursuant to agreements and contracts related to the International Space Station; provided that the Government makes such disclosure subject to prohibition against further use and disclosure. (b) In the event this contract is terminated for Contract or default, the Government shall have

(b) in the event this contract is terminated for Contractor default, the Government shall have Government purpose rights in all data first produced wholly or in part at private expense in performance of this contract.

(c) This notice shall be marked on any reproduction of these data, in whole or in part.

Distribution limited to Commercial Crew Transportation Capability (CCtCap) contract support personnel.

# **Parachute Analysis**



- Trailing Deployable Aerodynamic Decelerator Design
  - The integrated space vehicle shall meet the intent of JSC 65985, Requirements for Human Spaceflight for the Trailing Deployable Aerodynamic Decelerator (TDAD) during the design and development of parachute and other similar systems.
- Past tests varied number of mains, drogues, dynamic pressure range, suspension lines, suspended weight, to provide input to models
  - Commercial Crew Parachute Airdrop Test (CCPAT) Project / NASA Main Parachute Asymmetry Test (NMPAT)
- NMPAT informs the pendulum and landing loads IV&V effort
- Pendulum IV&V effort complete and in review
- Other IV&V tasks for Parachutes
  - Margins analysis of the parachutes
  - Analysis of suspension line loads
  - Creation of inflation parameter dispersion models (EDL, Aborts)



MAY CONTAIN PROPRIETARY AND/OR LIMITED RIGHTS DATA, NOT YET REVIEWED FOR EXPORT CONTROL

COI
ATTENTION
Use this space to indicate categories, inside dissemination controls, spacial instructions, puture of contract, etc., if model.
CUL// SP- BUDG / EXPT/ PROPIN
CUI Designation by
Please Contact:
ATTENTION
ATTENTION All individuals handling this information are required to protect it from unauthorized disclosure.
ATTENTION All individuals handling this information are required to protect it from unauthorized discloware. Handling, storage, reproduction, and disposition of the attached document(s) must be in accordance with 32 CFR Part 2002 and applicable agency policy.
<b>EXTENSION</b> All individuals handling this information are required to protect it from unauthorized disclosure. Handling, storage, reproduction, and disposition of the attached document(s) must be in accordance with 32 CFR Part 2002 and applicable agency policy. Access to and disseministion of Controlled Unclassified Information shall be allowed as necessary and parmissible to any individual(s), organization(s), or grouping(s) of users, provided accels or disseministion is consistent with or in farbanence of a Lawful Government Purpose and in a manner consistent with or in farbanence of a Lawful Government Purpose and in a manner consistent with
<section-header><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></section-header>



# Major Program Review

# Commercial Space Division (CSD) Commercial Crew Program (CCP) Overview Phil McAlister, CSD Division Director



# CCP/Boeing: Red Issues



Technical Performance Issue: (b)(3)

Mitigation:

- Asymmetry TIM conducted allowing convergence of analytical approaches and assumptions
- NASA/Boeing agreed on utilization of pendulum testing conditions including a mass drop to generate highly loaded conditions where asymmetry data was missing

<u>Status:</u>

- Additional testing successful in defining high load asymmetry reducing the impact on margins
- New margins calculated allow CCP to move forward without the need for significant redesign for CFT single flight use
- Procuring new build main parachutes for PCM-1 and subsequent flights and finalizing closure plan for remaining technical issues

For NASA Internal use Only